

**Healthcare Workforce Development Division**

400 R Street, Suite 330
 Sacramento, California 95811-6213
 (916) 326-3700
 Fax (916) 322-2588
 www.oshpd.ca.gov



November 18, 2009 Meeting Notes
California Healthcare Workforce Clearinghouse Advisory Team

DoubleTree Hotel Sacramento, 2001 Point West Way, Sacramento, CA 95815
 10:00 a.m. – 1:00 p.m.

Participants Present:

Patrick Ramirez	California Health Professions Consortium
Kevin Barnett	California Health Workforce Alliance
Stephanie Leach	California Labor and Workforce Development Agency
Caryn Rizell	California Primary Care Association
Nancy Anton	California Senate Education Committee
Brian Stiger	Department of Consumer Affairs
Linda Davis-Alldritt	Department of Education, Learning Support and Partnerships Division
Cindy Beck	Department of Education, Secondary, Career & Adult Learning Division
Robert Stroud	Department of Health Care Services
Leila Cook	Department of Managed Health Care
Inna Tysoe	Department of Mental Health
Kim DeWeese	Department of Public Health
Steve Saxton	Employment Development Department, Labor Market Information Division
Carolyn Lee	Health Occupations Students of America
Stephen Robinson	Health Professional
Douglas Sale	California Workforce Investment Board
Al Hernandez-Santana	Latino Coalition for a Healthy California
Chad Silva	Latino Coalition for a Healthy California
Tara Vang	Sierra Health Foundation

OSHPD's Staff and Vendors Present: Heather Baltazar, Alex Chin, Stephanie Clendenin, Nancy Gemignani, Deborah Holstein, Angela Minniefield, Pamella Petty, Senita Robinson, Dorian Rodriguez, Warren Sherard, Deb Wong, Elizabeth Shanower, Dhiraj Talwar, Mary Lou Ur'quizo

Handouts:

- Agenda
- Clearinghouse Statute: Health and Safety Code Sections 128050-128052
- Revised October 8, 2008 Meeting Notes
- California Health Professions Licensing Authorities
- California Health Licensing Authorities Data Collection
- Healthcare Professions
- California Employment Projection 2006-2016, Health Occupations
- Survey Tool for Licensing Authorities (Proposed Draft)

- Diversity Definitions (Proposed Draft)
- Clearinghouse Data Collection Priorities
- PowerPoint Clearinghouse Technical Update
- North Carolina Health Professions Data System
- Data Report: Dentist Workforce in North Carolina
- Assembly Bill 1310 (Hernandez)
- California Health Workforce Alliance: A Public-Private Partnership to Meet California's Health Workforce Needs
- Clearinghouse Update Preference Questionnaire

Welcome and Opening Remarks – Angela Minniefield

Angela Minniefield, OSHPD's Deputy Director, Healthcare Workforce Development Division (HWDD), opened the meeting. She welcomed new members and designees, thanked everyone for their attendance and led participant introductions. She reviewed the agenda and stated that staff would discuss program accomplishments since the October 8, 2008 Advisory Team meeting.

Ms. Minniefield provided a background on the development of the Healthcare Workforce Clearinghouse Program (Clearinghouse). She explained that the California Senate Office of Research (SOR) was conducting research on allied health occupations in 2005, but was unable to pinpoint a central source to complete comprehensive research. The SOR also noticed conflicting information from various data sources. Consequently, the California Senate introduced legislation in the 2005-06 fiscal year, Senate Bill (SB) 1309 (Scott), to create the Clearinghouse, centralize the State's healthcare workforce and education data, disseminate and report on the data, and monitor the State's healthcare workforce supply and demand. The bill did not pass due to funding issues, but resurfaced and passed as SB 139 (Scott) in fiscal year 2007-08.

The Clearinghouse mandates OSHPD to work with state licensing entities, state education entities and the Employment Development Department's Labor Market Information Division (EDD-LMID) to collect data on current supply, diversity, geographical distribution, current and forecasted demand of healthcare workers, and educational capacities to produce licensed healthcare workers by specialty. Ms. Minniefield stated that OSHPD must also prepare an annual report to the Legislature that uses the collected data to help shape policy that addresses workforce shortages and distribution in California.

She mentioned that OSHPD sought funding from The California Endowment (TCE) to conduct preliminary work for the Clearinghouse. The funding helped OSHPD staff:

- Convene five regional stakeholder focus group sessions to inform the general public of the Clearinghouse and elicit information to build a user-friendly data collection, dissemination and reporting infrastructure,
- Establish a 35-member Advisory Team to encourage stakeholder participation, coordinate attendance for the regional focus groups and maintain program development transparency,
- Secure a contractor to develop a Feasibility Study Report (FSR) that identified appropriate staffing resources and development of a data collection infrastructure, and
- Conduct an assessment of other states healthcare workforce and education data collection efforts.

Ms. Minniefield, stated that Ignatius Bau, J.D., TCE Program Director of Health Systems, was instrumental in helping OSHPD and other public and private organizations secure funding to address healthcare workforce diversity and shortages, cultural and language competencies, and access to care issues for several years. She stated that he would be leaving TCE and expressed her sentiment for his earnest efforts, as well as other TCE staff, and acknowledged how much he would be missed by all. Ms. Minniefield introduced Senita Robinson, Chief of the HWDD Research, Policy and Planning Section, and Clearinghouse Program Manager, to provide updates on program development activities and data collection priorities.

Clearinghouse Updates – OSHPD Staff

A. Program Development: Senita Robinson

Ms. Robinson stated that OSHPD has hired half of the Clearinghouse staff and that management expected completion of most of the hiring by February 2010. She reviewed program development activities that included the following:

- 1) OSHPD identified and spoke to multiple statutory partners: the Department of Consumer Affairs (DCA), 22 state health licensing authorities, EDD-LMID, and 3 state higher education systems that include the University of California (UC) Office of the President, California Community Colleges Chancellor's Office (CCCCO) and the California State University (CSU) Office of the Chancellor. Ms. Robinson emphasized that the state level education providers represent data collection from the 10 UC campuses, 23 CSU campuses and 110 CCC campuses. She also stated the three education systems suggested that OSHPD work with the California Postsecondary Education Commission (CPEC) since it already collects considerable student and facility data from them. She mentioned that CPEC has been very supportive in providing assistance to OSHPD staff regarding available education data.
- 2) OSHPD created internal work teams including a Clearinghouse Executive Steering Committee to develop and oversee Clearinghouse activities, products and overall system infrastructure.
- 3) Staff identified data collected by the statutory data providers and CPEC to ascertain the types and volume of available data as stipulated in the Clearinghouse statute.
- 4) Staff developed program work plans, administrative manuals, and documented workload processes.
- 5) Staff modified a listing of California's 22 health licensing authorities for dissemination to anyone.
- 6) Staff completed defining statutory terms as requested by the members from previous Advisory Team meetings, to ensure a common understanding of ambiguous terms, such as health specialty, geographical area, diversity and educational capacity.
- 7) Staff developed a proposed survey tool (draft stage) to assist the licensing authorities with data collection, where appropriate and if able to do so. Ms. Robinson asked members to review the proposed survey draft and clarified that most licensing authorities do not survey their members for most of the statutory data. She did state, however, that seven boards including the Medical

Board of California, Board of Registered Nursing (BRN), and the Dental Board of California conduct surveys to capture considerable data when licensees renew their licenses. The Advisory Team reviewed the proposed survey tool and recommended the following:

- a) Modify the retirement question to also include “retire within the next 2 years,” “working part-time” or “plan to work part time,”
- b) Modify the language question to capture the bilingual aspects on written proficiency. For example, rephrase the language question to state: “Are you fluent in languages other than English? If yes, Verbal? or Written? If No, skip the language section” (Note: members stated the language information is critical for emergency response needs; beneficial for understanding the needs of the community; and necessary for better communication to improve access to care.)
- c) Modify the education question to capture all degrees received and types of degrees pursuing,
- d) Compare the proposed survey to the survey used by the California Medical Association,
- e) Modify the work activity question to measure how much time a licensee spends performing each work activity by using a percentage. The percentage would determine the amount of time workers spend on an activity, such as patient care versus administration, research, etc.
- f) Separate Laotian and Hmong race categories,
- g) Modify the African race to “African Born” and include “Black Caribbean,” and
- h) Members agreed that staff captured all foreign language categories sufficiently.

Brian Stiger, Director of Department of Consumer Affairs, stated that DCA could help OSHPD coordinate meetings with targeted licensing boards. He stated he would need ample notice to work with the Boards to promote the Clearinghouse and inform them of the proposed survey tool.

- 8) Staff modified a listing of Health Professions distributed at the October 8, 2008 Advisory Team meeting. Ms. Robinson stated staff defined health specialty and health occupations according to a national coding structure established by the U.S. Department of Labor’s Bureau of Labor Statistics (BLS) Standard Occupational Classification (SOC) System. She mentioned the SOC codes are used by EDD-LMID in their occupational projections and by education partners to cross match education programs and related occupations. Ms. Robinson referred members to the 2006-2016 occupation projections handout and pointed out the SOC codes and occupational titles. Steve Saxton, EDD-LMID Deputy Director, stated the projections data are collected by survey for all occupations via the BLS Occupational Employment Statistics (OES) Program.

Linda Davis-Alldritt, School Nurse and Health Services Consultant, Department of Education, stated that there are approximately 2,800 school nurses in the state. She stressed that school nurses are Registered Nurses (RN) and must hold a school nurse credential and a Bachelor’s

degree. She asked OSHPD staff to add school nurses under the RN category on the Health Professions listing.

- 9) Staff identified health education and training programs as defined by the U.S. Department of Education's Classification of Instructional Programs (CIP).
- 10) OSHPD secured a contractor to assist staff identify business and technical requirements for the Clearinghouse system and work with the data providers regarding data collection related activities.

B. Data Collection Priorities – Senita Robinson

Ms. Robinson reviewed the Data Collection Priorities Handout and stated the priorities changed since the October 8th Advisory Team meeting. OSHPD will target occupations licensed by the Medical Board, BRN, Physician Assistant Committee, Respiratory Care Board and Board of Vocational Nursing and Psychiatric Technicians. She mentioned the Medical Board, BRN and Dental Board have existing statutes to collect similar healthcare workforce and education data.

C. Data System Infrastructure Development – Warren Sherard

Mr. Sherard, Clearinghouse Project Manager, provided a technical update on the Clearinghouse start-up planning phases. He described the Clearinghouse Project team, scope of the project and introduced OSHPD's requirements vendor consultant, Visionary Integration Professionals (VIP). He stated that VIP will help OSHPD develop the Clearinghouse infrastructure by capturing business requirements (such as data needs, desired functions, and program schedules) and technical requirements (such as data resources, data record layout, and data exchange options). VIP also will assist OSHPD in facilitating meetings with the various data providers to identify data collection processes and standards. He informed members that OSHPD will begin system design activities based on identified requirements in the next six months or so. He also emphasized that it is critical for everyone to remain focused on good planning and coordination efforts to build an efficient Clearinghouse data collection, dissemination and reporting system.

D. North Carolina Healthcare Workforce Data Collection Efforts – Warren Sherard

Mr. Sherard mentioned that he would be traveling to North Carolina to visit their Health Professions Data System. Mr. Sherard and Nancy Gemignani, Clearinghouse Data Architect, plan to meet with staff from the Cecil G. Sheps Center for Health Services Research (HSR) to identify lessons learned on the business and technical environments regarding data collection, reporting and dissemination. They also hope to learn how North Carolina encourages and improves participation by their licensing entities without state level mandates. Staff disseminated a brochure on North Carolina's HSR, as well as one of its system's reporting products, "*The Dentist Workforce in North Carolina, UNC The Cecil G. Sheps Center for Health Services Research, January 15, 2009.*"

E. Legislation – Pamela Petty

Pamela Petty, Clearinghouse Legislation and Data Analyst, mentioned that there were three bills introduced in 2009 that affect the Clearinghouse:

- Senate Bill 43 (Alquist) would have authorized (1) healing arts Boards under the umbrella of DCA to collect information regarding the cultural and linguistic competency of persons licensed by that Board and (2) EDD's Director to share confidential data with OSHPD for the purposes of the Clearinghouse. She stated the bill was gutted and no longer affected the Clearinghouse.
- Assembly Bill 657 (Hernandez) would authorize OSHPD in collaboration with the California Workforce Investment Board, to establish a healthcare workforce task force to assist in the development of a healthcare workforce master plan for California. This bill, similar to AB 2375 (Hernandez, 2008), was vetoed.
- Assembly Bill 1310 (Hernandez) adds a section to the Business and Professions Code requiring DCA's healing arts Boards to collect specified information from licenses. Ms. Petty stated that AB 1310 is a two-year bill that requires the healing arts Boards to collect certain data outlined in the Clearinghouse statute, that DCA create a database to help transfer statutory data to the Clearinghouse and the OSHPD submit an annual written report to the Legislature no later than March 1, commencing 2012.

F. What's New! California Health Workforce Alliance (Alliance) – Kevin Barnett

Kevin Barnett, Co-Director, stated the Alliance launched in June 2009 and focuses on the implementation of coordinated and strategic strategies to meet California's emerging health workforce needs, including diversity. The goal of the Alliance is to support and identify workforce priorities and address policy, programmatic and systems solutions that apply to multiple professions and sectors. Its members are working on establishing an infrastructure, securing resources, and providing a single point of convergence. He stated that coordinated actions are needed to ensure that the future workforce and economic needs are met. He stated the Alliance established four committees to address the following, as outlined in his handout:

- Commitment to health workforce as priority that requires coordinated, sustained action.
- A master plan to meet health workforce needs and provide opportunity to more Californians.
- An infrastructure for plan execution, responding to changing needs and emerging challenges.
- Greater synergy among and targeted investment in public and private workforce programs to increase scale, sustainability and impact and to minimize costly duplication and fragmentation.
- Better positioning of California for health reform, economic stimulus or external workforce funding.
- Alignment of workforce needs with training program capacity and candidate preparation.
- An increased pool of qualified California professionals and students pursuing priority health professions that reflect our diverse communities at a scale sufficient to meet future health workforce needs.

The Alliance's Steering Committee plans to establish priorities in December 2009. A website will be coming soon.

Additional Updates from Advisory Team Members:

Mr. Saxton mentioned that EDD-LMID is partnering with the California Department of Education (CDE) on a proposal for longitudinal data to connect K-12 through higher education and work. The CDE in collaboration with CCCs, CSUs, and UCs are proposing to enter into a Joint Powers Authority agreement to build a P-20 longitudinal data system that will be capable of linking with

EDD's data. They also collaborated with CPEC and other stakeholders to submit the grant proposal to the U.S. Department of Education, Institute of Education Sciences under the recent American Recovery and Reinvestment Act of 2009 funding opportunity. Mr. Saxton suggested that Advisory Team members contact T. Michelle Magyar, Ph.D., Education Programs Consultant at CDE, for more information. Ms. Magyar can be reached at (916) 319-0459 or mmagyar@cde.ca.gov.

Nancy Anton, California Senate Education Committee Consultant, requested that the Clearinghouse Advisory Team and staff research problems and issues in the education pipeline to identify health professions that appear to be experiencing a shortage. The Clearinghouse should be able to identify areas of shortages once implemented.

G. Status Reporting Preferences: Quarterly, Biennially, Annually? Angela Minniefield and Warren Sherard

Ms. Minniefield and Mr. Sherard reviewed a questionnaire that would identify member's preferences to receive Clearinghouse updates. The questionnaire addressed frequencies (quarterly, biennially and annually), meeting formats (via website, e-mail, formal meetings, conference calls or mail) and continued interest in assisting OSHPD to test the Clearinghouse on-line product. Ms. Minniefield stated that OSHPD will strive for continuous communication with the Advisory Team and seek member's input throughout the Clearinghouse system's design phases.

Review Advisory Team Action Items: Angela Minniefield

Ms. Minniefield reviewed action items as follows:

- **Add "School Nurses" under the Registered Nurses category on the Health Professions listing.**
- **Advisory Team members review the proposed survey tool (draft) and provide additional comments/suggestions to Alex Chin, OSHPD Data Analyst, and (916) 326-3781.**
- **Ms. Robinson contact Brian Stiger, DCA, to coordinate OSHPD data collection kick-off meetings with DCA health licensing entities.**
- **Advisory Team members complete the Status Reporting Preferences questionnaire and return to OSHPD staff.**

Meeting Adjournment

Ms. Minniefield thanked everyone for their continued support in assisting OSHPD with the development of the Clearinghouse infrastructure. She also mentioned that members should contact staff should they have suggestions or concerns at any time.

The meeting adjourned at 1:00 p.m.